

Comment

YAO, Keisuke

Prior to this workshop, there have been two papers which examined Dutch sources relating to early modern Japan. One was a paper of Prof. Yokoyama⁽¹⁾, which was published in 1992, based on the records of the Dutch ministry for foreign affairs related to Japan. The other was by Prof. Matsui⁽²⁾, in 2001, on the VOC document relating to Japan at the National Archives, *Alsip National*, in Indonesia. These papers show us the importance of research using Dutch sources. We must be careful to connect this workshop with this worthwhile idea. In 2001, Prof. Matsui also made a noteworthy presentation at the memorial symposium for Prof. Kanai. It proposed a direction of study for the future and she pointed out the importance of using the 'fringe' of Dutch documents relating to Japan, the importance of human resources, and the necessity for cooperation among institutes, archives and universities. In my opinion, "fringe documents" represent a key idea for this workshop as well as the ideas 'private' and 'application'. I hope that these issues will receive ample discussion.

Today we will hear 4 papers based on each study. The paper of Ms. Matsukata is interested with the lecture of Dr. Moeshart in this morning. In a this detailed lecture, there seem to be two pairs of subjects, the study of Dutch diplomatic policy toward Japan just before the opening of the country (Moeshart and Matsukata) and the study of merchandises in the Dutch-Japanese trade (Ishida and Sakuraba). Finally we heard a paper presenting scientific study by Prof. Tsukahara. The study seems to differ with other papers. But it is also concerned with 'private records' as well as other studies.

The first paper by Ms. Matsukata examined preceding studies by Prof. Nagazumi⁽³⁾ and Prof. Fujita⁽⁴⁾ and it used sources from the Ministry of the Colonies (*Kolonial Archief*) concerned with Dutch foreign policy toward Japan and it concluded that the sending of King, Willem II's letter was successful as result. It argued that the Minister of the Colonies realized the limitation of the negotiation between Japanese officials and the Dutch representative at Nagasaki and so the minister determined to send the letter of the king directly. But, in my opinion, it should be clearly shown what kind of document the conclusion was based on and how the document was described.

In the second paper, Prof. Ishida has done examinations based on both Dutch and Japanese materials, which were made in each stage of trade. He compared and explained

the differences among these. Today he focused on the variety of invoices *facturen* of Dutch East India Company and did a comparison of the *facturen* and the sample-books called *Mihon-chou* of Japanese merchants. I believe he was able to explain the limitations of the Dutch materials and the significance of the comparison more concretely.

The third paper of Ms. Sakuraba estimated the shape of the medical vessel *gallipot* and she examined the invoice *facturen* of the 1650's and she concluded that Dutch Company was ordered to make *gallipot*. It was a new and a curious study because she attempts an applied study of Dutch documents. In my opinion, the papers of Ms. Sakuraba and the following paper by Prof. Tsukahara each seem to suggest the above-mentioned 'fringe' more concretely. That is, the various applications of Dutch records which were official.

The last paper by Prof. Tsukahara examined meteorological data in the first half of the 19th century. But, at the same time, it showed also the personal role in history from a new point of view. He examined meteorological observations, which were recorded by von Siebold. He examined the meteorological observations in the cultural and ideological context related to Western Learning, *Rangaku*.

To conclude, until now, we have examined many Dutch sources related to Japan in the context of the relation between our two countries, Japan and the Netherlands. But, from now on, we should also keep in mind the various applications for study on Dutch resources.

At first, we should use Dutch documents in new contexts. For example, Kazuhiro Yukutake made it possible to know the building materials of warehouses in detail by examining the journals *Negotie Journalen* of the Dutch factory in Hirado which had been recognized as useful material for the study of trade⁽⁵⁾. Today the paper by Prof. Tsukahara and Ms. Sakuraba show us the same kind of application.

Secondly we should notice the personal role and the mental feeling in social history from the sources, especially from private records. There will give a kind of reality to history which has largely been based on using the official records. In this morning's lecture, Dr. Moeshart showed us the importance using the private records of local archives, for example, the documents of van den Broek. We can find other examples easily. The letters of Isaac Titsing, which were published by Dr. Lequin, show us not only the life of Titsing but also his friendship and correspondence with Japanese interpreters of the Dutch language, *Oranda-Tsuji*, at Nagasaki⁽⁶⁾. Fortunately the book has just been translated by Prof. Yokoyama⁽⁷⁾.

Recently I myself did some research on private documents of interpreters, the families of *Nakayama* and *Narabayashi*, in the second half of the 18th century at Nagasaki. It shows the groundwork which was laid between Japanese authorities and Dutch representatives. They took a middle position, which was marginal and belonged to neither side. The documents show their knowledge and personal curiosity concerning various spheres of Western culture, food and customs, among other things, which were never recorded in the official

documents of both Japan and the Netherlands. It was also useful to know European lifestyles in the 18th century. Not only the official sources like those of the Dutch Company and the Ministry but also private information sources should be published. These publications will promote various studies by both countries based on Dutch sources relating to Japan.

- (1) Yokoyama, Y., *Nihon no Kaikou to Oranda no Gaikou* (The Opening Port of Japan and the Diplomacy of the Netherlands), Y. Arano eds., *Ajia no Naka no Nohon* (Japan in Asia), vol.2, Tokyo Daigaku Shoppan-kai (The University Press of Tokyo), Tokyo, 1992.
- (2) Matsui, Y., *Indonesia Kokuritsu Monjokan shozou Oranda-jidai-shiryō nit suite-Nohon-kankei-monjo wo chusin ni-* (On the Historical Material of Dutch Colonial Age in Alsip National Republik Indonesia- Centering on the Document related to Japan), Tokyo Daigaku Shiryo Hensan-jo Kenkyu Kiyō (The Annual Report of the Historiographical Institute of the University of Tokyo), no.11, 2001.
- (3) Nagazumi, Y., *Tsusin-no-kuni kara Tsushou-no-kuni e* (From the Country of Trade to the Country of Correspondence), *Nihon Rekishi*, no.458, 1986.
- (4) Fujita, S., *Bakuhansei-kokka no Seijisi-teki Kenkyū* (A Political Study on the History of the State of the Shogunate), Azekura-shobo, Tokyo, 1987.
- (5) Yukutake, K., *Hirado Oranda Shokan no Tainichi Boeki to Shokan Kenzo-butsu* (The Dutch Factory at Hirado: Its Trade with Japan and Related Buildings), *Nichiran-gakkai Kaishi* (The Bulletin of the Japan-Netherlands Institute), vol.20, no.1, 1995.
- (6) Lequin, F., *The Private Correspondence of Isaac Titsingh*, vol. 1-2, 1990, 1992.
- (7) Yokoyama, Y. eds., *Oranda Shokan-cho no Mita Nihon* (The Description of Japan by Dutch Chief Factor at Deshima), Yosikawa Kobun-kan, Tokyo, 2005.